

Harmonization of Tourism Regulation towards the Tourism Industry in the Era of the Industrial Revolution 4.0 in Indonesia

Sigit Irianto

17 August 1945 University, Semarang City, Indonesia

Email: drsigitirianto@gmail.com

Abstract

Tourism regulation is the basis for handling, protecting, and developing tourism in Indonesia. Tourism becomes a multi-component industry and generates a lot of foreign exchange for the country. Tourism activities involve various aspects, such as transportation, accommodation, marketing of people's handicrafts, service businesses, entertainment and amusement centers, and also traditional arts. The potential to move towards a welfare state for Indonesia can actually be realized, because Indonesia is not only a country that has extraordinary natural resources and cultural diversity, but also a country that has a wide area. In fact, Indonesia is a country that still face serious welfare issues, and tourism has also not been able to play a maximum role in realizing community welfare. The legal aspect in the tourism sector is to provide guarantees of protection and legal certainty for all parties involved in it. The industrial revolution 4.0 posed a challenge in the tourism sector because it gave rise to a new paradigm of digitalization and human relations with machines became the basis for tourism development. The industrial revolution 4.0 caused the tourism industry to develop rapidly because it was no longer limited by space and time and changed the conventional business model that is transactional into a model of a very personal relationships. The relationship in the tourism business is the result of disruption of the industrial revolution 4.0 and is the result of a digitalization model in the tourism industry.

Keywords: Regulation, harmonization, tourism, industrial revolution 4.0, foreign exchange.

1. Introduction

Tourism has become one of the largest industries in the world, and is a mainstay in generating foreign exchange in various countries, [1] and is very influential in various sectors (Foreign exchange earnings from tourism in 2011 reached 8.5 billion US dollars, or increased 11.8 percent compared to 2010. The growth of Indonesian tourism is classified as fantastic because it exceeds world numbers and economic growth in Indonesia, which is projected at 6.5% [2]. In 2019, it is expected to increase by US \$ 20 billion or around 17.6% from foreign exchange revenues in 2018 that is US \$ 17 billion [3].

Tourism as an industry can not stand alone, but is a series of activities that produce services or products that are different from one another. The difference is not only in the product or service produced, but also in the size of the company, geographical location, function, management of the organization, and the marketing method [4]. Products from the tourism industry are all services and products provided by companies to tourists since the tourists leave their residences to the tourist destination then returns home. Companies that provide services or products for tourism vary greatly, ranging from information, tickets, transportation, lodging, food, clothing, travel agencies that arrange trips and other services and tourist attractions.

Various aspects of tourism show that tourism can be studied from various perspectives. In general, tourism is an industry, although in initial stage it was seen as an economic

activity. As one of the largest industries in the world, tourism has developed so rapidly, and influenced other sectors, especially the cultural, economic, security, political, social, international relations, etc. The legal aspect in the tourism sector is to provide guarantees of protection and legal certainty for all parties involved in it.

John Naisbitt [5] stated that tourism is a multi-component industry in which many parts of it are linked inextricably to the economic sector. As one of the regional economic potentials that needs to be developed is the strategy. Development strategy and the regional economic potential will depend on the economic development strategy adopted by the region [6].

Sometimes tourism is also referred to as invisible export, because many countries in the world have successfully collected large amounts of foreign exchange and tourism activities. Tourism as a source of income for state and community consists of various activities that support tourism, such as compensation for sea, land and air transportation services, catering and restaurants; accommodation (hotels, motels, inns, etc.), fabrication and marketing of thousands of kinds of handicrafts (souvenirs, novelties); tour guides, travel agency, including entertainment and amusement centers, and even traditional arts are a source of income for state and community.

Tourism as an industry can not be separated from the industrial revolution 4.0 that disrupt all aspects of the global industry, because the industrial revolution 4.0 led to various breakthroughs in the field of technology. The industrial revolution 4.0 has changed the order of life and the in development of people's way of thinking who demand fast, effective and efficient services in order to increase their productivity. Law Number 10 Year 2009 about Tourism emerged in the era of the industrial revolution 3.0 which is still the basis for the development of computerized technology. In the era of the industrial revolution 4.0, digitalization became an essential part of tourism industry. Because with digitalization, the offering of tourism products can go through cyberspace by doing business online by posting pictures, videos, WhatsApp, and various activities that can be known and understood by its business target.

One of the technological developments in the era of the industrial revolution 4.0 is artificial intelligence (AI) where computer or machine technology is at the level of intelligence like humans and can be regulated and controlled in accordance with human will. The main superiority of artificial intelligence is its ability to continuously analyzed the received data. The more data received and analyzed, the better artificial intelligence in making predictions [7]. The industrial revolution 4.0 has disrupted various fields. Industrial Revolution 4.0 has disrupted various fields with digitalization through intelligence engineering and the internet from things as the basis of connection and development of human relations with machines. Humans no longer have to face-to-face in undergoing business relations in the industrial field, because human and machine connections have opened relationships between people in their relationships and in meeting their needs.

The era of digital technology causes business to run quickly, no need to wait long to get the service of any business, including business in tourism. Interaction runs quickly because it is no longer limited by space and time and transforms the conventional business model that is transactional into a a very personal relationship model because only the involved parties are connected and the meeting can be held virtually. Relationships in business is the result of the industrial revolution 4.0 disruption and are the result of a digitalization model in the tourism industry.

Based on the background description, the formulations of the problem are:

- a. How is the harmonization of the tourism regulation sector towards the tourism industry during the industrial revolution 4.0 era in Indonesia?
- b. What steps have been taken by the Government in the field of tourism towards the tourism industry in the era of the industrial revolution 4.0 in Indonesia?

2. Result and Discussion

2.1. Harmonization of Tourism Regulation towards the Tourism Industry in the Era of the Industrial Revolution 4.0 in Indonesia.

The renewal of laws and regulations in the field of tourism shows an increasingly complex society dynamics and the changing of the local government system from centralized to decentralized requires a set of laws and regulations that are able to support the existence of the tourism industry. The enactment of Law Number 10 Year 2009 regarding Tourism is the legal basis for regulating tourism in Indonesia. Considerations of the Law on Tourism states that tourism is an integral part of national development, because the tourism is attached to various things including as one of the major foreign exchange earners for the country, employment, economic growth, and people's income increment.

Considerations of Law Number 10 Year 2009 regarding Tourism, in letters c and d mention:

- a. That tourism is an integral part of national development carried out in a systematic, planned, integrated, sustainable and responsible manner while still providing protection for religious values, culture that lives in the community, environmental sustainability and quality, and national interests;
- b. That the development of tourism is needed to encourage equal distribution of business opportunities and benefits and be able to face the challenges of the alteration in local, national and global life.

Based on the mentioned considerations, it appears that the inherent aspects in dealing with tourism are very complex, because it involves various things, ranging from regulation, to the protection of religious and cultural values, including the challenges of the alteration and the effects of globalization.

According to Article 1 Number (3) Law Number 10 Year 2009 about Tourism, stated that: "Tourism is a variety of tourist activities and is supported by various facilities and services provided by the community, business people, the Government, and Local Governments."

The definition of tourism as mentioned in Article 1 Number (4) is: "Tourism is an entirety activity related to tourist activities and is multidimensional and multidisciplinary in nature which emerges as a manifestation every person and country needs and interactions among tourists and the local community, fellow tourists, the Government, Local Governments, and entrepreneurs."

Tourism involves the Government, local governments, communities and entrepreneurs. The involvement of these four components shows that tourism is not only the Government's responsibility but also all components of the community engaged in the field of tourism, especially the communities where the tourism object is located, and entrepreneurs. This is based on the principles stipulated in Article 2 Law Number 10 Year 2009, namely: benefits, kinship, fair and equitable, balance, independence, eternity, participatory, sustainable, democratic, equality; and unity.

The philosophical content in the laws and regulations can be seen whether changes to the tourism law and the laws of the Regional Government through the tourism industry can realize people's welfare. Another approach that can be used is the economic approach to the law and the tourism system. The tourism system approach can be interpreted with the tourism industry.

The potential to move towards a welfare state for Indonesia can actually be realized, because Indonesia is not only a country that has extraordinary natural resources and cultural diversity, but also a country that has a wide area. In fact, Indonesia is a country that still face serious welfare issues, and tourism has also not been able to play a maximum role in realizing community welfare.

One way to realize prosperity is to implement the concept of the welfare state, because the concept of the welfare state is an ideal model of development that is focused on improving welfare through giving a more important role to the state in providing universal and comprehensive social services to its citizens. Spicker [8], for example, states that the welfare state "... stands for a developed ideal in which welfare is provided comprehensively by the state to the best possible standards".

The welfare state refers to the responsive role of the government in managing and organizing the economy so it is able to carry out its responsibilities to ensure the availability of certain basic welfare services for its citizens [9]. This concept is seen as a form of state involvement in advancing people's welfare after the emergence of empirical evidence regarding market failure in capitalist society and state failure in socialist society [10]. The state treats the application of social policy as "the granting of social rights" to its citizens. All social protection built and supported by the state is actually funded by its people through increasingly prosperous and equitable economic productivity, taxation and insurance systems, also a well-planned and institutionalized human investment [11].

The welfare state is the middle ground of the ideology of capitalism and socialism. The concept of welfare states thrives in democratic and capitalist countries, not in socialist countries. In Western countries, welfare states are often seen as the 'antidote' strategy of capitalism, which is the negative impact of a free market economy.

Welfare state is often referred to as a form of 'compassionate capitalism'. Although with a different model, capitalist and democratic countries such as Western Europe, USA, Australia and New Zealand are some examples of adherents of the welfare state. Meanwhile, former Soviet Union and the Eastern Block countries generally did not adopt a welfare state, because they were neither democratic nor capitalist [12].

The welfare state (welfare state) is announced briefly as public policy and state activities in the integration of economic and social policies in accordance with the prosperity achievement^[13].

The role of the state in social services is important, but it does not mean that the welfare state is a form of state domination, but rather the form and existence of citizen awareness of their rights in accordance with democratic principles. The state is mandated to carry out its obligations in fulfilling the citizens' rights [14].

The efforts of the state in realizing the welfare of the people mainly depend on the ability of the state to manage all potential economic resources, especially in the field of trade and services and the mechanisms that regulate this potential to become a real force to create an equitable and prosperous society. Tourism as one of the potential economic resources can be played out larger and wider because tourism has various product that can become one of the main pillars of a country's economy.

On the other hand, the ability of a state to cultivate all its potential cannot be realized on its own, due to the limitations it has, such as funds, technology, and human resources. In order to realize the welfare of its people, the state still needs the private sector that has the funds, technology and human resources to realize tourism as one of the pillars of the country's economy. The role of the private sector in the tourism sector is not only supports government policies to develop tourism, but must be able to realize the existence of the tourism industry, as part of tourism development.

Regulations on tourism cannot be separated from other laws and regulations related to tourism, especially regulation related to authority that handle and develop tourism are still overlapping. Such conditions indicate that harmonization of regulations in the field of tourism has not yet been fully implemented.

The concept of harmonization of regulation in the legal literature in the Netherlands was put forward by Jan Michiel Ott [15]: “When unnecessary incongruities occur between different elements of legal system which pertain to the same subject, an effort for harmonization can be made. This is such adaption of those elements that the incongruities are removed, that a better result is obtained, while the respective identities of those elements are kept in fact...”.

Efforts to harmonize the legal system with regard to an imbalance between the differences in the elements of the legal system can be done by removing the balance and making adjustments to the elements of the different legal systems. Conceptually, the harmonization of the legal system can be carried comprehensively which will involve the link among the three components of the legal system, such as the legal substance, legal structure and its institution, and legal culture, or part of the link of the three components of the legal system.

The context of the harmonization of law in Indonesia can be found in Article 2 Presidential Decree Number 188 Year 1998, as follows: “In the context of harmonizing, the conceptions integration and consolidation that will be outlined in the Law Draft, the Minister or Chairperson of the initiating Agency for the organizer of the Law Draft must first consult the conception with the Minister of Justice and the Minister and other relevant Institution Heads”.

Article 5, Presidential Decree Number 188 Year 1998, said : Efforts to harmonize, integrative, and stabilize the conceptions of law draft are directed at the realization of the alignment of the conception with the state ideology, national goals and the aspirations that surround them, the Constitution of The Republic of Indonesia Year 1945, Outline Direction of The Country, other existing laws and all the implementing regulations and other policies related to the field to be arranged in the law draft. Attachment of Law Number 25 Year 2000, said: the objective of the program to form laws and regulations is to create harmonization of laws and regulations that are in accordance with the aspirations of the people and development needs.

Law Number 12 Year 2011, regarding the Formation of Laws and Regulations, Article 46 paragraph (2) and Article 47 paragraph (3). Article 46 paragraph (2) states: Harmonization, integration, and consolidation of the concept of the Law Draft originating from the DPR is coordinated by the DPR's equipment which specifically deals with the field of legislation.

Article 47 paragraph (3) states: “Harmonization, integration, and consolidation of the conception of law draft originating from the President, coordinated by the minister who held government affairs in the field of law”.

This principle also applies in the preparation of local regulations, as stated in Article 58 paragraph (1), as follows: “Harmonization, integration, and consolidation of the

conception of the Provincial Regulation draft originating from the Assembly of Provincial is coordinated by the Assembly of Provincial equipment that specifically handles the field of legislation.”

Harmonization in the field of law and legislation is important to realize the legal order and legislation still adhering to the principles of balance, harmonious, and consistent for the benefit of individuals and communities with the interests of the nation and state. The formulation of the principle of balance, harmonious, and consistent is found as one of the general principles of good administration. The formulation of this principle is an elaboration of the intention of harmonizing the law, as a scientific activity towards the process of harmonizing written law that refers to philosophical, sociological, economic and juridical values. This includes balance, harmonious, and consistent with unwritten laws that live in society, international and bilateral conventions and treaties that have been ratified by Indonesia [16].

According to L.M. Gandhi [17] that Harmonization in law includes the adjustment of laws and regulations, government decisions, legal decisions, legal systems and legal principles with the aim of enhancing legal unity, legal certainty, justice and comparability, usefulness and clarity of law, without obscuring and sacrificing legal pluralism.

Based on the above definitions, it can be concluded that the harmonization of the law, is an effort or process that aim at overcoming the limitations of differences, contradictory matters and irregularities in the law. Efforts or processes to realize consistency conformity, harmony, compatibility, balance among legal norms in the legislation as a legal system within a single national legal system framework.

Harmonization of this law is also a foothold for regulation in the tourism industry considering that several laws and regulations are still based on Law Number. 9 Year 1990, and the laws and regulations relating to tourism are not fully in line yet. The aim is that the Government, Provincial and District/City Governments can manage tourism potential well, and can become one of the means of development to realize people's welfare.

On an international scale, tourism has become a priority for poverty alleviation, as the Yogyakarta Declaration stated on February 9, 2006. This declaration was attended by representatives of 31 member states of the United Nations World Tourism Organization (UNWTO) to produce a joint statement which became the basis for alleviating poverty, through cultural tourism based on local communities, improved welfare that can certainly be achieved [18]. The declaration was conveyed by UNWTO General Secretary Francesco Frangialli, emphasizing the importance of protecting cultural and natural heritage since 1972. Unesco has also recommended the safeguarding of traditional and popular culture in 1969 [19]. The Declaration also recommended traditional and popular culture safeguarding in 1989, and the New York Declaration instrument for tourism to achieve development in the millennium era in 2005. The UNWTO noted the various potentials of cultural tourism for socio-economic development and poverty alleviation. Security, protection, and maintenance can bring back cultural authenticity in local communities. UNWTO views the importance of local policy values, knowledge, and cultural life as tourism development activities. Tourism development also involves other regulation such as tourism, natural resources and human resources as a step to realize the tourism industry.

The tourism industry can improve the limitations of the state by cultivating the potential sector to be real, in the field of tourism. The tourism industry can also increase the ability of tourism resources in each region that are not the same, have different types of product variants and different growth. Besides that, it can also help to equalize regional perceptions, because each region has a different perspective on the importance of the

tourism industry and the multiplier effect it creates. Some regions often neglect the quality of their products, or ignore their tourism potential, or do not maintain the quality of their tourism properly. Cleanliness, health, order, security and comfort of the destination are conditions that must be considered by the stakeholders and managers of tourism. The private sector can handle all tourism products through its capital, technology, and human resources to improve the quality of tourism products, while the Government continues to carry out its obligations to realize the people's welfare, such as acting as a regulator to organize everything related to tourism.

Tourism arrangements also cannot be separated from the industrial revolution 4.0 which began rolling in 2011. The industrial revolution 4.0 concerns all aspects of human life with all intelligence and sophistication in the digital field, especially those concerning information. The industrial revolution 4.0 integrates digitalization with industry, including the tourism industry. The industrial revolution 4.0 has the potential to increase the level of global income and improve the quality of life for the world community, will produce cheap and competitive prices, increase efficiency and productivity, reduce transportation and communication costs, increase the effectiveness of logistics and global supply chains, reduce trade costs, opening new markets and driving economic growth [20]. The presence of the industrial revolution 4.0 not only changed the industry, but also jobs, ways of communicating, shopping, transactions, even lifestyle. Therefore, in addition to maintaining the existence of a business, various skills are needed to be able to deal with this era [21].

Inaccuracy and dishonesty of information, slow and incorrect data existence, lack of ability to utilize technology, planning that is not solution oriented, policies contingency, low quality facilities and infrastructure, management that is not community base oriented, limited product maintenance costs, unclear guidance, errors in analyzing markets, misplacement of destinations / products, poor quality, quantity and promotion effectiveness are common tourism problems in Indonesia.

General issues in the field of tourism can be overcome by implementing AI which analyze incoming data and producing accurate results. AI drives innovation across a growing number of production and services and the more data we have, the better the predictions we get [22].

Indonesia's tourism potential is one form of comparative advantage compared to other countries. The owned advantages are still potential, because tourism still can't be used as one of the economic pillars that can improve people's lives. This can be known by comparing with other countries, especially in ASEAN countries that Indonesia as a tourist destination is still below other countries such as Thailand, Singapore, and Malaysia. Tourism has not yet become an industry that can be a source of foreign exchange for the country, so the potential nature of the tourism sector should be changed into a real economy in tourism.

The differences in the level of awareness, ability, professionalism and independence of the community, especially individuals and associations of the tourism industry in managing the tourism market can cause its own problems. This problem can be overcome with the foundation of data accuracy and honesty of information as well as honesty and openness as the moral foundation of the tourism industry.

The handling of tourism is not only sectoral but is a system, so optimization to make tourism as a foreign exchange earner cannot be separated from the division of authority to regulate tourism, such as inter departments and between the government and regional governments.

2.2. Steps The Government Has Taken In The Field Of Tourism Towards The Tourism Industry In The Industrial Revolution Era 4.0 In Indonesia.

Article 1 paragraph 9 Law Number 10 Year 2009 about Tourism confirms that: “The Tourism Industry is a collection of tourism businesses that are interrelated in the context of producing goods and/or services to meet the needs of tourists in the administration of tourism”.

Tourism is an industrial business that produces goods or services for the tourism needs and management. As an industry, many parties are involved in it, such as the Government, the community, and tourism stakeholders in the framework of developing tourism and changing the nature potential to become real in the field of tourism.

Indonesia's tourism potential is one form of comparative advantage compared to other countries. The owned advantages are still potential, because tourism still cannot be used as one of the economic pillars that can improve people's lives. This can be known by comparing Indonesia with other countries, especially in ASEAN countries where Indonesia as a tourist destination is still below Thailand, Singapore and Malaysia. Tourism has not yet become an industry that can be a source of foreign exchange for the country.

Another factor that can affect the tourism sector is the way the government handles the development of tourism itself. Mismanagement of tourism can have an impact on the decline in the number of tourist visits. Mistakes in handling tourism have occurred in Indonesia, such as, **first**, the birth of Presidential Decree Number. 15 Year 1983 opened 34 gateways, giving visa-free to citizens from 46 countries, and vast opportunities for investment in tourism. Impact of this Presidential is the occurrence of massive visa misuse from 46 visa-free countries. Not all countries that obtain visa-free visas for their citizens to visit Indonesia have the potential to send bona fide tourists. Not to mention the need to reproduce the device, supervision of various possible misuse of visa-free visits, something that is difficult to monitor [23]. Indonesia has gates 11 times more than Singapore, but until now it cannot match the level of tourist arrivals to Singapore which incidentally only has 3 gates. The same thing applies to foreign exchange earnings. This is so tragic that when the fuel crisis occurred, no one knew where the existence of foreign exchange tourism [24]. **Second**, the Presidential Statement in 1997 which stated that the end of Five Year Development VII (Year 2004) tourism would be the number one foreign exchange earner replacing the role of oil and gas. This statement was not followed up optimally in the field of tourism, whether through promotion, infrastructure development, marketing and so on. The result was that tourism still proceeding as it was.

The security sector is also a crucial area to attract foreign tourists visiting Indonesia. Bombing in Kuta sub-district of Bali has had a devastating effect on the handling of security throughout Indonesia. Trust in security is getting worse, also sweeping actions against foreign tourists and many demonstrations worsen the effect. Travel warning is one indicator of distrust of the quality of certain tourist destinations. These problems if not properly addressed, can hinder the achievement of tourist arrivals and reduce the picture of Indonesia as one of the leading tourist destinations.

The existence of a good quality hotel sometimes becomes insignificant for tourists, if it turns out that the environment is unhealthy, uncomfortable, or the tourist loses his belongings. To overcome these problems, a shared perception is needed through coordination, program integration, perception equalization, service standardization, and many other things that will eventually give birth to a mutual symbiosis relationship between stakeholders, between stakeholders and tourism products, and between product. Orientation on excellent service to tourists, is believed to make a memorable memories and automatically become a vehicle for effective promotion.

As a system, the regulation of the tourism sector cannot be separated from other sectors. Regulations at the central and provincial, district and city levels must also be harmonized with international conventions. Harmonization of settings occurs because there is an imbalance between the different elements of regulation. Harmonization can be done by making adjustments to the elements of the different legal systems. Harmonization of this arrangement will provide the roles and responsibilities to the parties involved. Therefore the role of tourism is expected to be able to realize the welfare of the people.

The steps taken by the Indonesian government in the field of tourism towards the industrial revolution 4.0 with Presidential Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 6 Year 2015 about the Creative Economy Agency. This regulation was then followed by the establishment of a new non-ministerial institution called the Creative Economy Agency which was responsible for the development of the creative economy in Indonesia. The Creative Economy Agency has task to assist the president in formulating, establishing, coordinating and synchronizing policies in the creative economy.

The Creative Economy Agency has a vision to develop Indonesia as one of the world economic forces in the creative economy in 2030. To achieve this vision, the Creative Economy Agency designed six major missions, such as:

- a. Uniting all assets and creative potential of Indonesia to achieve a creative economy independency.
- b. Creating a conducive climate for the development of creative industries.
- c. Encouraging innovation in creative fields that have added value and competitiveness in the international world.
- d. Opening public insight and appreciation of all aspects that related to the creative economy.
- e. Building awareness and appreciation of intellectual property rights, including legal protection of copyright.
- f. Designing and implementing specific strategies to place Indonesia in the map of global creative economy.

Other steps are, as stated by the Minister of Tourism Arief Yahya [25], with the era of Creative or cultural Industry in the industrial revolution 4.0. travelers nowadays, especially millennial, 70% has already enjoy the benefits of the digital era. They see destinations, send messages and pay for travelling in one application on a smart phone quickly, cheaply and easily.

The way to welcome the industrial revolution 4.0 is by setting up a digital platform under the name New ITX (Indonesia Tourism Exchange). This platform is a display of digital tangible tourism products. Therefore Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprise still exist by selling packages through the digital marketplace. The phenomenon's of the presence of Online Travel Agents (OTA) is getting stronger and reduce the number of the conventional travel agent business. For example, Traveloka has achieved the title of unicorn digital company Indonesia. According to the Minister of Tourism, an obstacle which inhibits growth of tourism is there are still 30% of Indonesian tourism people who are still comfortable using the old business model. To overcome this, the Minister of Tourism will conduct counseling so that all Indonesian tourism actors are digital literate [26]. Other steps that can be taken in order to increase foreign tourist visits to Indonesia or local tourist to visit various local tourist areas are the participation of tourists with the local community. Tourists visiting a tourist destination are motivated by the desire to know, know or learn about the region and the culture of the local community [27]. This

type of cultural tourism becomes a tourist attraction with a distinct appearance of cultural appearance. For example: the involvement of tourists by playing angklung together with artists and local people at Angklung Mang Udjo's house in Bandung, is a form of interaction between tourists and local people and local artists. This is as Reisinger [28] said:

“Cultural differences, together with asymmetry of the frequent and transitory tourist-host contact, are the most important factors with influence interaction difficulties between tourists and host. Therefore, understanding of cross-cultural background of tourists and hosts is the key feature for identification and the effects of this interaction on overall tourist holiday satisfaction.”

Cultural differences and the values contained in it become one of the most valuable aspects in developing tourism in Indonesia. Visitors are not only be treated to beautiful and amazing natural attractions, but also cultural tourism that can provide an inner touch for the audience with the high artistic value given by the ethnic groups in Indonesia.

3. Conclusion

Tourism is an industry that becomes a source of foreign exchange for the country. Harmonization of laws and regulations in the field of tourism becomes the foundation and policy in developing and changing the potential nature to be real in the tourism sector. Changes in the conventional nature of tourism handling must be changed by digitalization in the era of the industrial revolution 4.0.

Indonesia has a wide variety of tourism both natural and cultural tourism, which is an advantage and distinctiveness of tourism in Indonesia. Digitalization in the field of tourism must be done in the context for giving tourist information, services, and experience about Indonesia. Digitalization does not change the values embodied in the cultural distinctiveness and traditional artistic values. The interaction between tourists and local communities with local artists in a direct involvement for enjoying traditional arts is a distinct feature and attraction for foreign tourists to come to Indonesia.

Acknowledgement

Data of this article reference from a lot of tourism factor in Indonesia. The acknowledgement will be dedicated for such as Angklung mang Udjo, tourism department, Tourism Company, and etc.

References

- [1] Pitana, I. Gde and Putu G. Gayatri, *Sosiologi Pariwisata*, Andi, Yogyakarta (2005), pp. 1.
- [2] Kompas Daily, about Economy and Tourism in the Midst of Crisis, Tuesday 17 January 2012, accessed August 19, 2019.
- [3] Basith, Abdul, in kontan.co.id, News Data Financial Tool, 13 February 2019, accessed August 20, 2019.
- [4] Yoeti, H. Oka A, *Pemasaran Pariwisata*, Angkasa, Bandung (1996), pp. 2.
- [5] Nassbitt, John, *Global Paradox*, Translated by Budijanto, Bina Warga Aksara, Jakarta (1998), pp. 45.
- [6] Suparmoko S., *Ekonomika Publik Untuk Keuangan Pembangunan Daerah*, Andi Offset, Yogyakarta (2001), pp. 100.
- [7] <https://www.jagoanhosting.com> (2019), accessed August 26, 2019.
- [8] Spicker, Paul, *Social Policy: Themes and Approaches*, London: Prentice Hall (1995), page. 82.

- [9] Esping-Andersen, Gosta, “*After the Golden Age? Welfare state Dilemmas in a Global Economy* in Gosta Esping-Andersen (eci), *Welfare States in Transition: National Adaptations in Global Economics* (1997), page. 1-31.
- [10] Husodo, Siswono Yudo, “*Membangun Negara Kesejahteraan*”, the paper is presented at the seminar: Reviewing the Relevance of Welfare State and Innovation through Decentralization-Autonomy in Indonesia, Institute for Research and Empowerment (IRE) Yogyakarta and the Jakarta Initiative Association, Magister of Management Universitas Gadjah Mada homestead, Yogyakarta July 25, 2006.
- [11] Suharto, Edi, *Analisis Kebijakan Publik: Panduan Praktis Mengkaji Masalah dan Kebijakan Sosial*, (third edition), Alfabeta, Bandung (2006), page. 3.
- [12] Suharto, Edi, *Analisis Kebijakan Publik: Panduan Praktis Mengkaji Masalah dan Kebijakan Sosial*, (third edition), Alfabeta, Bandung (2006), page. 47.
- [13] Research Team PSIK, *Negara Kesejahteraan & Globalisasi, Pengembangan Kebijakan dan Perbandingan Pengalaman*, Paramadina University, Jakarta (2007), page. 2.
- [14] Suharto, Edi, *Kebijakan Sosial Sebagai Kebijakan Publik: Peran Pembangunan Kesejahteraan Sosial dan Pekerjaan Sosial dalam Mewujudkan Negara Kesejahteraan di Indonesia*, Alfabeta, Bandung (2007), page 45.
- [15] Otto, Jan Michiel, “*Implementation of Environmental Law: Harmonization, Environmental Management and Enforcement by The Courts, With References to Indonesia and The Netherlands*”, B. Arief Sidharta, et al., *Butir-butir Gagasan tentang Penyelenggaraan Hukum dan Pemerintahan yang Layak*, Citra Aditya Bakti, Bandung (1996), page. 247.
- [16] Wargakusumah, Moh. Hasan, et al., *Perumusan Harmonisasi Hukum Tentang Metodologi Harmonisasi Hukum*, National Legal Development Agency, Ministry of Justice, Jakarta (1997), page. 37.
- [17] Gandhi, L. M., *Harmonisasi Hukum Menuju Hukum yang Responsif*, Speech of Inauguration of Professor of Law Faculty of Indonesia University, Jakarta (1995) page. 30.
- [18] The declaration was conveyed by UNWTO General Secretary Francesco Frangialli, emphasizing the importance of protecting cultural and natural heritage since 1972. Unesco has also recommended the safeguarding of traditional and popular culture in 1969. www.kompas.com, Yogyakarta Declaration to Promote Welfare. 10 February 2006, accessed August 26, 2019.
- [19] www.kompas.com, Yogyakarta Declaration to Promote Welfare. 10 Februari 2006, accessed, August 26, 2019.
- [20] <http://indonews.id/revolusi-industri-ke-4-dan-intergrasinya-dalam-tata-kelola-negara>, accessed August 15, 2019.
- [21] Agustina, Tri Siwi, *Kewirausahaan di Era Revolusi Industri 4.0.*, Mitra Wacana media, Bogor (2019), pp. 11.
- [22] Savitri, Astrid, *Industrial Revolution 4.0, Turning Challenges into Opportunities in the Disruption Era 4.0*, Genesis, Yogyakarta (2019), pp. 143.
- [23] Yasamihardja, Sutopo, *Back to Basic of Indonesia Tourism*, Sinar Harapan Daily, Friday 29 September 2006.
- [24] Yasamihardja, Sutopo, *Back to Basic of Indonesia Tourism*, Sinar Harapan Daily, Friday 29 September 2006.
- [25] Kompas.com. accessed August 26, 2019.
- [26] Kompas.com. accessed August 26, 2019.
- [27] Pitana, I. Gde and Putu G. Gayatri, *Sosiologi Pariwisata*, Andi Offset, Yogyakarta (2005), pp. 81.
- [28] Pitana, I. Gde and Putu G. Gayatri, *Sosiologi Pariwisata*, Andi Offset, Yogyakarta (2005), pp. 83.