

## Public Services Of Indonesian Immigration Polytechnic Services

Shohirin<sup>1</sup>, Muhamad Ali Embi<sup>2</sup>  
*PhD Student Ghazali Shafie Graduate School of Government,  
Universiti Utara Malaysia<sup>1</sup>  
Professor College of Law, Government and International Studies  
Universiti Utara Malaysia<sup>2</sup>*

### **Abstract**

*One of the duties of the Immigration Polytechnic is to hold (public services). To be able to provide good and satisfying services to the community, the Immigration Polytechnic has long been determined to form a clean and authoritative apparatus in carrying out its duties. In accordance with Law Number 6 of 2011 concerning Immigration, the Directorate General of Immigration is an element of the government that has the task of regulating the traffic of people entering or leaving Indonesian territory as well as its supervision in order to maintain the upholding of the country's sovereignty. The functions carried out by the Directorate General of Immigration include immigration services, immigration law enforcement, State security, and community welfare development facilitators. The study wants to reveal the implementation of public services at the Immigration Polytechnic in order to support national development and better service quality. Results of research First, the service process can provide good service to citizens. Second, even though it took a long time to process the services provided, the provision of services continued to run well. Third, there are some people who complain about the existence of services that remain the input of the Immigration Polytechnic apparatus. Fourth, the implementation of the Immigration Polytechnic's performance can be easily adapted despite changes related to the implementation of new rules*

**Keywords:** *Public Services-Poltakem-Indonesia*

### **Introduction**

Public service is not as simple as imagined, or in other words, it is very complex both in terms of the value of service delivery itself and about the best way of providing public service itself. This complexity and uncertainty encourage public service providers to take professional steps based on "discretion" and it is this discretion that often leads public service providers or government officials to act out of line with ethical codes or guidelines for existing behavior.

In the provision of public services especially in Indonesia, moral and ethical violations can be observed starting from the public policy process (program entrepreneurs, projects, and activities that are not based on reality), the design of certain public service organizations, public service management processes that are full of engineering and camouflage (ranging from technical planning, financial management, HR, information, etc.), all of which appear from non-transparent, non-responsive, unaccountable, unfair, etc. In the field of immigration services as explained at the outset that there are still elements of immigration who commit unethical actions in the form of corrupt behavior thus caught red-handed by the KPK raises a concern.

This concern is mainly related to the fact that immigration officials already have a code of ethics contained in the regulation of the Minister of Law and Human Rights of the Republic of Indonesia Number M.HH-02.KP.05.02 of 2010. In reality, the existence of this code of ethics does not seem to have a meaningful indeed for the Indonesian immigration apparatus (Briando, 2017). The code of ethics is still only a "decoration" of a profession without meaning. Both in the realm of thought and daily actions of the apparatus (Ludigdo, 2012). Even this code of conduct is something that is far from the idealism of immigration people. For Indonesia in general and immigration in particular, the improvement of morality that has occurred so far is still limited to lip service and does not really touch the substance of moral reformation itself (Pasaribu & Briando, 2019b). Therefore moral or ethical reform is a "big burden" in the

future and if not taken seriously, the process of "decay" continues to occur and can have an impact on the disintegration of the nation (Ludigdo, 2009). This situation is interesting to study further. Why is that, because a code of ethics or code of conduct is a codification of a professional value standard that must be obeyed. Society believes in the immigration apparatus because the apparatus works based on a standard of value. This professional value standard is a crystallization of existing and developing noble values in a society that is considered suitable for adoption of a profession.

However, it should be realized that the crystallization of these values is obtained through the thinking of a group of experts in the profession. Surely these experts are not human beings who are free of values and interests. The idea of a group of experts is always encouraged and based on cultural, economic and political assumptions that surround them, and of course their ideological interest bias (Ludigdo, 2012). Therefore, the full adoption of ethical standards from other countries and international organizations, as practiced by professional organizations in general, is not the best step to develop the ethical behavior of the Indonesian immigration apparatus (Pasaribu & Briando, 2019a). On that basis and in an atmosphere of pride on Indonesia, conveying the idea of the ethical meaning of immigration employees with their own perspectives encouraged by the unique spirit of immigration becomes something important to do.

It has been understood that Indonesia in general, including the immigration system in particular, has a great foundation and outlook because it can be the glue for the territorial unity which is fragmented in a group of islands with its ethnic diversity. Bhumi Phura Wira Wibawa's motto which implies immigration has an important role in maintaining the entrance and exit gates of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia to become the spirit for the immigration apparatus in carrying out their duties and functions. This is reflected in the Basic Principles of the Code of Ethics

Immigration officials who are manifestations of Panca Bhakti Insan Imigrasi. Panca Bhakti Insan Imigrasi are local wisdom for the immigration apparatus in carrying out their duties and functions. Panca Bhakti Insan Imigrasi is the spirit for the immigration apparatus in carrying out the function of immigration, namely immigration services, immigration law enforcement, State security and community welfare development facilitators. To be able to internalize the value of Panca Bhakti Insan Imigrasi cannot be separated from educational factors. This is because many people who put their hopes in educational institutions thus they not only provide knowledge or skills to students, but also understanding and forming soft skills such as character, attitude and behavior in daily life. These three aspects will eventually become the basis for forming and evaluating one's competence as a result of an educational process. One of the points of quality based on the above definition is a high moral value and the results of quality graduates, the intended graduates are education that can produce useful output in accordance with stakeholder expectations and can be relied on in the community. The Immigration Polytechnic is an official school which is a transformation of the Immigration academy under the Ministry of Law and Human Rights in shaping the character of immigration officials. The Immigration Academy (AIM) is a tertiary education institution within the Ministry of Law and Human Rights that conducts professional education services, especially directed at the application of expertise and knowledge in the field of immigration. After going through several quite long processes, now AIM has been transformed into an Immigration Polytechnic (Poltekim). Poltekim has a vision that is to make HR (Human Resources) Immigration possessing intellectual intelligence, emotional intelligence, and spiritual intelligence. While its mission is to instill the values of struggle to form a habituation for worship, noble character, continuous learning, work, useful, unpretentious, and clean hearted. The vision and mission of AIM is directed in order to achieve the objective of establishing AIM, namely to create leadership cadres within the future Directorate General of Immigration and the Ministry of Justice and Human Rights where graduates will later be placed in all immigration offices in Indonesia and or in immigration representatives abroad.

Therefore, in the future in the event of building and strengthening immigration apparatus there should be synergization on the patterns of education with good services. In the pattern of education, Immigration Polytechnic uses patterns based on the Decree of the Minister of Law and Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number: M.08-DL.01-05 of 2000 concerning Teaching, Training and Care Guidelines at the

Immigration Academy or known as "jarlatsuh", which stands for teaching, training and care. This will then become a common thread in internalizing the values of character education to cadets at the Immigration Polytechnic.

Podungge's study results (2014) related to realizing a bureaucracy that prioritizes public service ethics provides a conclusion that in carrying out government tasks, development and community empowerment, the government must always be responsive in responding to the needs and interests of the community by prioritizing ethical and public services moral so as to create excellent public service.

Based on the facts that the presence of moral violations done by immigration apparatus although the code of ethics have been made based on the value of Panca Bhakti Insan Imigrasi as well as the education patterns that have been running through the method of "jarlatsuh" indicating that immigration apparatus do not apply the value contained in Panca Bhakti Insan Imigrasi, namely namely Takwa, Uphold honor, Scholar, Personal Integrity and Innovative in carrying out immigration functions including immigration services, immigration law enforcement, State security, and facilitators of the development of people's welfare as mandated by Law Number 6 of 2011 concerning Immigration and regulations of the Minister of Law and Immigration Human Rights of the Republic of Indonesia Number M.HH-02.KP.05.02 of 2010 concerning the Immigration Employee Code of Ethics. Panca Bhakti Insan Imigrasi is expected to become a holistic ethical concept in providing immigration public services in Indonesia. This can be achieved if the servants who are run by the Immigration Polytechnic are in accordance with the values contained in Panca Bhakti Insan Imigrasi.

### **Theoretical Framework**

Public services organized by the Government aim to improve the social welfare of its citizens, etc. stated by Sondang P. Siagian, that one of the functions of government in development is as an innovator, especially innovators in the field of State administration itself, which means that the productivity of government officials is increasingly improved and services to the community are better and faster (Siagian, 1972: 45)

In this case Syahrir added, in developing countries the welfare of the community depends on their ability to gain access to be able to use public services (Syahrir in Prisma No. 12, 1986: 14). According to Syahrir, public services are all activities carried out by the government and private sector that produce goods and services intended to meet public needs (Syahrir in Prisma No. 12. 1986: 11). Almost the same as what Syahrir said was also stated by Mifta Thoha, Mifta Thoha public service as a social service. Thoha reiterated that social service is something done by a person or group of people or certain institutions to provide assistance to the public in order to achieve a certain goal (Thoha, 2004: 39).

Looking at the definition and objective of public services from the three experts above it can be concluded that the public service is absolutely needed in social life. Today, public services are urgently needed in social life. Today, public services have gained the people's demands, reckoning that the needs of the community have also increased and complex, in addition to the desire of the society will increase the quality of service provided. Added by Miftah, public services or social services have become an important aspect because they always in contact with the public regarding the interests of many people. Therefore, concerning the interests of many people, this social service becomes very sensitive, if there is not a small amount of service delivery, it will quickly offend the comments of people who felt the social service (Thoha, 2004: 39)

According to Fandy Tjiptono, in essence there are three keys to superior service provision. First, the ability to understand types of clients and the desire of clients. Second, the development of database that are more accurate from competitors (including data on needs and desire of every segments of the clients and changes to the condition of the competitors). Third, the utilization of information obtained from market research in a theoretical framework (Fandy, 1997 :128).

Moenir also said that there are several factors that must be considered in the implementation of services, among others are the awareness of officials involved in public services, the regulatory factor becomes the

basis of service work, the organizational factor is a tool and system that enables the operation of service activities, the skills or capabilities of officers and facility factor in the implementation of service tasks (Moenir, 2005: 88)

Goetsch Davis in Yamit, 2001, made a broader definition of quality namely, "quality is a dynamic condition associated with service products, people, processes and the environment meeting or exceeding expectations". The approach put forward by Goetsch Davis confirms that quality does not only emphasize the aspect of the end result, namely products and services but also concerns human quality, process quality and environmental quality, it is impossible to produce quality products and services without going through human and quality processes. Service provider companies place more emphasis on process quality because consumers are usually directly involved in the process (Zulian Yamit, 2001 : 8-9)

Whereas J. Suprpto (1997: 228) said that quality is a word for service providers which is something that must be performed well. The application of quality as a nature of market leader or as a strategy to continue to grow. The superiority of a service product depends on the rise as well as quality maintained by the service they are in accordance with the hopes and desires of the client or the community users of these services.

The government as a "service provider" for the community is demanded to provide increasingly high quality services for that the government must actively assess in order to be more anticipatory, competitive and can use these principles to measure the success of the government itself in carrying out its functions and duties and moreover to be able to improve the development of the government itself both in the eyes of the public and the international world. For every organization, research on the performance of an activity is very important. The research can be used as a service for organizations in a certain time frame. The research can also be used as inputs for further improvement of the organization (Mc. Donald and Lowton, 1997). Syahrir said whether quality of service is good or bad in the process of organizational activities in an effort to meet the needs of the community, both goods or services. (Syahrir in Prisma No. 12, 1986: 14) From some of the expert opinions it can be stated here that the concept of public service is interpreted as achieving an optimal level of success reliably and the ability of officials to provide services to the community.

## **Research Method**

Mixed method research is a variety of studies that collaborate quantitative research and qualitative research in which the data obtained from one of the various studies is used as a reinforcement and complementary data analysis. This research collects and analyzes data obtained quantitatively and qualitatively. In a variety of mixed method research, quantitative data consists of closed information as found in the attitude, behavior, and performance instruments. Quantitative data collection in a mixed method research is carried out using a closed-ended checklist where the researcher checks the behavior seen. At any time, quantitative information can be found in documents such as census documents or attendance documents. Data analysis certainly uses statistics based on values obtained from research instruments to answer research problems or test hypotheses. The mixed method research is a unique variety of research which uses two types of data, quantitative and qualitative data in their research. The two types of data obtained in the research process are mixed in order to obtain maximum information. Through mixing data, the researcher will gain an understanding of a topic in greater depth than if it only uses one type of data. In mixed method research, there are three types of data mixing used in conducting analysis, namely data merging, data linking, and data attachment where the two types of research data obtained do not stand alone. In addition, data mixing can also be done through single study techniques or multiple studies. Two types of research in the triangulation design are convergence models and data transformation models that actually have similarities in processing data. The difference is in the steps taken by the researcher in combining and interpreting two different data. Data interpretation in the convergence model is done by analyzing quantitative and qualitative data first, then combining them. Meanwhile, data transformation model is carried out by changing the analysis of qualitative data to a new quantitative interpretation overall. This type of validating quantitative data model is used to deepen the

findings obtained from research processes such as surveys. The fourth type, multilevel model, is used to conduct in-depth studies with different levels of analysis.

### **Discussion and Research Results**

Public service is a series of activities carried out by the government and its apparatus to the community in realizing the improvement of the quality of people's lives while at the same time providing satisfaction to the people served. As one form of government responsibility to the community, of course, a public service organized by the government must include all people who need it, and most importantly, how people are satisfied from the services provided to them. Public services are public service activities carried out by government agencies both at the central and regional levels in an effort to meet the needs of the community and in the context of the implementation of orders.

To be able to provide satisfying services for service users, service delivery must meet the service principle stated in Law No. 25 of 2009 concerning Public Services, CHAPTER II, Article 4 states the principles of public service as follows:

- 1) Public interest;
- 2) Legal Certainty;
- 3) Equal Rights;
- 4) Balance of Rights and Obligations;
- 5) Professionalism;
- 6) Participatory;
- 7) Equality of Treatment / Non-Discrimination;
- 8) Openness;
- 9) Accountability;
- 10) Special Facilities and Treatment for Vulnerable Groups;
- 11) Timeliness; and
- 12) Speed, Ease and Affordability.

The implementation of public services carried out by government officials in various service joints, including those concerning the fulfillment of civil rights and basic needs of the population, is still not felt as expected by the community. This can be seen, among other things, from the large number of complaints from the public both directly conveyed to the head of the service and through letters in various mass media. On the other hand the community as the main element served has not provided effective control to become a driving element in the effort to improve the quality of public services.

But in creating a quality service that gives birth to the satisfaction of the people who receive it, it is not as easy as turning the palm of the hand. There are still many things that become obstacles and other factors that cause public services organized by the government are felt to be lacking and tend not to carry out wholeheartedly. We still encounter many complaints from the public and the mass media which assess that the quality of public services organized by the government is not yet optimal.

Of course the situation as above must be addressed and improved to create and realize an increasingly better state of the country. Moreover, the phenomenon that has taken place in our country today, with the passing of the era of regional autonomy should have been by the creation of decentralization of power from the central government to regional governments further accelerate the process of public service to the community.

The efforts to improve public services carried out by servants of the Immigration Polytechnic employees include:

- 1) Improving the quality of behavior and professionalism of government officials.  
Increasing human resources and professionalism of employees is an aspect that should be considered in an effort to improve public services. The condition of bureaucrats with skills, behavior that complies with applicable laws and regulations, as well as the placement of positions in accordance with their fields, will certainly have a positive impact on the creation of quality public services.
- 2) Creating a public service policy that is not too procedural and convoluted.

One form of the policy is to publish or create minimum service standards. Minimum service standard is a public policy that regulates the type and quality of basic services entitled to be obtained by every community at a minimum. This policy was also made in line with the implementation of the process of decentralization of power in our country, therefore with this mechanism the community in each region is able to receive optimal services from the government.

In addition to accelerating the process of implementing services the Immigration Polytechnic publishes minimum service standards also aims to provide the type of service along with its transparency and accountability to the public. So with this policy, it will avoid deviant behavior that has been carried out by the government apparatus in providing services to the public. One other side that should be considered by the government in efforts to improve public services is to increase the provision of facilities that support the quality of public services. This is because without the support of the availability of complete facilities, it will hamper the process of providing public services to the community. Along with the development of increasingly sophisticated technology, it is fitting for the government to implement technological advancements to support the delivery of public services. The improvement of this facility certainly includes physical and non-physical facilities.

In providing services, the hope of the community at the Immigration Polytechnic is not to impose and the absence of bribes, other than that demands for accuracy and from servants are also demands. This is according to one community representative as follows:

*This timeliness, for example, is made as a rule of 3 days or five days. At the moment it is a long one week. But it was also realized that the community needed to know why it took so long. Sometimes it also takes a long time because the requirements for submission have not yet been met. And also sometimes there is a rush that must be resolved immediately by the district officials. What's clear is that we need to be fast and on time. We think this will be input to the sub-district government”.*

Meanwhile, according to the Immigration Polytechnic Staff: as follows:

*” We all hope and want the servants to serve quickly, no delay and of course the citizens are happy. Today, in the Subdistrict of Tempuran currently working on the complaints that arise from the community. The efforts we have made to achieve improved service quality are to improve the service system and adequate facilities which certainly support the service.*

In providing services for various functions and activities, the Immigration Polytechnic Staff needs various facilities and infrastructure. The service infrastructure referred to is all kinds of equipment, work equipment and other facilities that function to support the performance of related institutions. Therefore, to ensure that all necessary equipment is available in a timely manner, the apparatus assigned to provide services must provide the following amount and type of equipment needed. One of the factors influencing the agency's ability to achieve its objectives is physically agreeable work conditions in the sense of a place that is not suffocating, adequate ventilation, clean rapid spatial planning, adequate work facilities and the like. To find out whether the infrastructure is in accordance with the type of work available in the Subdistrict of Tempuran according to the available data is sufficient in accordance with the needs. Existing infrastructure facilities certainly support the work system and needs. Therefore the apparatus will be adjusted to the available facilities. From the results of the study it can be stated that the infrastructure will be able to support the performance of services smoother and precisely in accordance with the time that becomes the will of the community.

## CONCLUSION

The service process of Immigration Polytechnic in general can be stated as fairly enough although there are lacks. One of the indicators can be seen from : First, the service process can give services well to the community. Second, although it takes quite long in the service process provided, however the provision of services continues to run well. Third, there are some people who complain about the existence of fixed-services become the input to the Immigration Polytechnic apparatus. Fourth, the implementation of the

Immigration Polytechnic's performance can be easily adapted despite changes related to the implementation of new rules

### REFERENCES

1. Almond, Grabiell A, 1960, *The Politics of Developing Areas*, Princeton University Press.
2. Ashari, Edy Topo. *Pemkab Sleman Perbaiki Mekanisme Pelayanan Publik*. Artikel Harian Kompas tanggal 9 Juni 2004. [http://www.gtzsfgg.or.id/cspsd/index\\_id.htm](http://www.gtzsfgg.or.id/cspsd/index_id.htm)
3. Arif, Lukman, 2007, *Diskresi Dalam Implementasi Kebijakan Pelayanan Publik*, Desertasi Program Pasca Sarjana, Universitas Brawijaya, Malang. Tidak dierbitkan.
4. Bank Dunia, 1999. *Peningkatan Kualitas Udara Perkotaan: Strategi Dan Rencana Aksi Lokal (LSAP): Aglomerasi Perkotaan. Technical Cooperation Project Between Indonesia – Asian Development Bank (ADB)*
5. Barzelay, Michael, 1992, *Breaking Through Bureaucracy: A New Vision For Managing Government*. Berkeley, California ; University of California Press.
6. Bovaird, Tony. 2007. *Beyond Engagement and Participation: User and Community Coproduction of Public Services. Public Administration Review*. Washington: Sep/Oct 2007. Vol. 67, Iss. 5; pg. 846, 15 pgs
7. Brown, Trevor. 2007. *Coercion versus Choice: Citizen Evaluations of Public Service Quality across Methods of Consumption. Public Administration Review*. Washington: May/Jun 2007. Vol. 67, Iss. 3; pg. 559, 14 pgs
8. Bullock, Charles S and Harrel R. Rodgers, Jr., 1972, *Civil Rights Policies and the Matter of Compliance*, dalam Chales Anderson, ed, *Caes In Public Policy Making*, University of Houston, New York.
9. Clarke, M. and J. Steward, 1992, *Public Service Orientation – Developing the Approach, Local Government Policy Making* 13, 4, : 23-42
10. Denhardt, Janet V. dan Robert V. Denhardt, *The New Public Service: Serving, not Steering*. M.E. Sharpe, New York. 2007
11. Dwiyanto, Agus. dkk., 2003, *Reformasi Tata Pemerintahan dan Otonomi Daerah*, Yogyakarta: PSKK-UGM. Vol. 3, No.2 , Juli 2003.
12. Elliasen, Kjell and Ian Kodiman 1993, *Managing Public Organization*, London : Sage Publications
13. Faisal, S. 1990. *Penelitian Sederhana*. Yayasan Asih Asah Asuh (YA3). Malang.
14. Flynn, Norman, 1990, *Public Sector Management Great Britain : Mavester Wheat Sheaf*
15. Frederickson, H. George, 1994, *Administrasi Negara Baru*, LP3ES, Jakarta
16. Fornengo, Graziella; Ottoz, Elisabetta. 2007. Hybrid Organisations In The Provision Of Local Public Services. *Journal of Public Procurement*. Boca Raton: 2007. Vol. 7, Iss. 1; pg. 34, 28 pgs

17. *Governance and Desentralization Survey (GDS)*. 2007. *Civil Service Employment by Level of Government: :Civil Service Sensus 2007*
18. Haerudin, Ihsan. 2005. *Reformasi Pelayanan Publik*. <http://www.pikiran-rakyat.com/cetak/0902/24/0802.htm>
19. Handyaningrat 1988 *Administrasi Pemerintahan Dalam Pembangunan Nasional*, Haji Masagung, Jakarta.
20. Hidayat, harjanto, S dan Syafii, M. 2004. *Pendekatan Partisipatif Dalam Layanan Publik*. Jurnal Inovasi, Vol. 2/XVI/November 2004.
21. Hodge, Graeme. 1993. *Minding Everybodies Business: Performance Management in Public Sector Agencies*. Monash University. Montech PTYLTD.
22. Hoksbergen, Roaland, 1986, "Approaches of Evaluation of Development Interventions : The Importance of Wold and Life Views", dalam Charles K. Wilber, ed. *The Methodological Foundation of Development Economics*, Pergamon Press, Oxford, New York.
23. Hughes. O.E.. 1994. *Public Manajemen & Administration*. New York : St Martins Press. Inc.
24. Intema. 1993. *Reformasi Pelayanan Publik: Apa yang Harus Dilakukan?"* dalam *Policy Brief, No. II/PB/2003*.
25. Islamy, M. Irfan, 2007, *Manajemen Perubahan di Sektor Publik*. Program Doktor Ilmu Administrasi Negara, FIA-UNIBRAW. Malang,
26. Keputusan MENPAN Nomor 63 Tahun 2004, tentang Penyelenggaraan Pelayanan Publik
27. Koentjaraningrat. 1985. *Metode-Metode Penelitian Masyarakat*. Gramedia Pustaka Utama. Jakarta.
28. Kurniawan, Teguh, 2006, *Pergeseran Paradigma Administrasi Publik: Dari Perilaku Model Klasik dan NPM ke Good Governance*, Paper Program S3 UGM Yogyakarta.
29. Lane, Jan Erick 1995 *Public Sector : Concepts, Models and Approaches*. California Sage Publications
30. Land Castles, 2004, *Demokrasi di Era Baru*, Pustaka Pelajar, Yogyakarta.
31. Mc. Callum Bruce, 1984, *The Public Service Manager: An introduction to Personel Management in The Australian Public Service*, Logman Cheshire Pty Limited, Melbourne Australia
32. McNabb, E David, 2002, *Research Methode in Public Administation and Non Profit Management: Quantitative and Qualitative Approaches*, ME Sharpe, London
33. Moenir, A.S. 2001. *Pendekatan Manusia dan Organisasi terhadap Pembinaan Kepegawaian*. Gunung Agung. Jakarta.
34. Moleong. 2005. *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. PT. Remaja Rosdakarya. Bandung.

35. Muluk, Khairul M.R. 2005, *New Public Service dan Pemerintah Lokal Partisipatif*, Makalah Pasca Sarjana Administrasi Universitas Brawijaya Malang.
36. Nugroho, 1999, *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*, Penerbit Rake Sarasin, Yogyakarta
37. Osborne, David and Peter Plastrik 1997, *Banishing Bureaucracy: The Five Strategies For Reinventing Government*. New York : Addison -Wesley Publishing.
38. Probokusumo, Yuyun, 2008, *New Public Service Dalam Masalah Perizinan di Indonesia*, Pasca Sarjana Universitas Gadjah Mada Yogyakarta, Disertasi tidak di terbitkan
39. Rawls, D. E., 1971. *Classics of Public Administration*, USA: Harcourt Brace & company,
40. Sedamayanti, 1999, *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia dan Produktivitas Kerja*, Andar Maju, Bandung
41. Strauss and Corbin. 1990. *Basic of Qualitative Research: Grounded Theory Procedures and Technique*. Newbury Park. Sage Publications. London.
42. Sugiyono. 1999. *Metode Penelitian Bisnis*. Cetakan pertama. Alfabeta. Bandung.
43. Suharko. 2005. *Merajut Demokrasi; Hubungan NGO, pemerintah, dan pengembangan Tata pemerintahan Demokratis (1966-2001)*. Tiara Wacana, Yogyakarta.
44. Sumartono. 2007. *Reformasi Administrasi dalam Pelayanan Publik*. Pidato Pengukuhan Jabatan Guru Besar dalam Ilmu Reformasi Administrasi Negara, FIA-UNIBRAW. Malang
45. Supranto, J. 1997. *Pengukuran Tingkat Kepuasan Pelanggan*. Rineka Cipta. Jakarta.
46. Tjiptono, Fandy. 1997. *Prinsip-Prinsip Total Quality Service*. Penerbit Andi, Yogyakarta.
47. Thoha, Miftah. 2003 *Ilmu Administrasi Negara*, Jakarta: Rajawali Press, cet. keVIII.
48. UNDP.1997. *Reconceptualising Governance; Discussion paper 2*. NewYork : United Nations Development Programme.